Individual Traits Influencing Quality in AD: Creativity and Expertise

Marina Ramos & Ana Rojo
Research on AD

- Creation and analysis of guidelines (Rai et al., 2010).
- Description of existing scripts (Jiménez, 2010).
- Reception of AD in different types of films (Ramos & Rojo, 2014).
Research on AD

- Creation and analysis of guidelines (Rai et al., 2010).
- Description of existing scripts (Jiménez, 2010).
- Reception of AD in different types of films (Ramos & Rojo, 2014).
- Impact of personality on AD?
Research on AD

- Creation and analysis of guidelines (Rai et al., 2010).
- Description of existing scripts (Jiménez, 2010).
- Reception of AD in different types of films (Ramos & Rojo, 2014).
- Influence of creativity on AD quality.
Quality in AD

• Quality = Reception + standardization
  – Reception:
    • Emotional impact: Ramos, 2015; 2016; Ramos & Rojo, 2014
    • Comprehension: Cabeza-Cáceres (2013)
Quality in AD (II)

• Guidelines:
  – basic framework, general strategy (Dosch & Benecke, 2004; Bittner, 2012).
  – Lack of sound arguments for the rules (Bittner, 2012)

• Describer’s role:
  – ISO (2015): Levels of importance determined by the person developing the AD
Objectivity/ Subjectivity

- Subjectivity should be avoided (AENOR, 2005: 8).

- “What you see is what you say” (Snyder, 2005: 195; American Council of the Blind, 2009).

- Bittner (2012): all guidelines coincide
Objectivity: contradictions

- Adjectives
- Emotional state of characters
- Lexicon
- Metaphors
- Inferences
- Literary language
Adjectives

• Neutral adjectives (Benecke & Dosch, 2004), avoid evaluative terms (ISO, 2015).

• Don’t shy away from using colours or describing a character as pretty, or handsome, where relevant to the story” (ITC, 2000).
Emotional states

• Facial expressions: neutral (Benecke y Dosch, 2004; Gonant y Morisset, 2008).

• ISO (2015): when important to understanding:
  – “evil smile” vs. “to sneer”.
Emotional states II

• DE/GR/US/UK: Avoid emotional states.

“He has squeezed his eyes shut, his cheeks are flushed, his lips pressed together” (DE).

• Time constraints?
Lexicon

• UK: verb variants: “She scuttles into the room” / “she enters the room.”

• US/ ISO: descriptive verbs are recommended:
  – walk vs. sashay, stroll, skip, stumble, saunter, glide, hobble, march, stagger, pace…

NEUTRAL?
Metaphors

• US: Metaphors: OK -> strong power to evoke vivid images linguistically.
  – Monument: “as high as fifty elephants stacked one on top of the other”.
  • NEUTRAL?

• YES/NO
  – NO: Chapado Sánchez (2010)
Inferences

• “Subjective or qualitative judgments or comments (…) constitute an interpretation on the part of the describer and are unnecessary and unwanted” (US).

• DE: “his stomach ulcer is hurting again” vs. “he presses his hand to his stomach, his face is distorted with pain”.

– TIME CONSTRAINTS!
Literary language

• AD as literary creation
  – US: AD=haiku
  – FR:"describers are creative writers in every sense of the term".

• Objectivity?
Research Questions

✓ What happens in real practice?

✓ Can personality factors influence describers’ work?

✓ Is it possible that describers’ work also exerts an influence on their personality traits?
Our Study

1. What influence does the describer’s creativity exert on the AD process?
   – On the objectivity principle.
   – On the quality of their work.

2. Is it possible to establish a correlation between describers’ work (years of experience) and their creativity scores?
Participants and Materials

- **Participants:**
  10 professional audio describers
  - Recruited on-line.

- **Materials:**
  - CREA (Corbalán et al., 2003).
  - AD task.
CREA test

- 4 minutes.
- Ask as many questions as possible about the image.
AD Task

- 4 highly poetic film scenes (1-2 min).
  - *The Tree of Life* (Terrence Malick, 2011).

- No language involved.
Subjectivity parameters

- Inferences
- Metaphors
- Connotative lexicon
- Emotional state of characters
- Evaluations
Quality parameters

• Correction sheet for AD (Marzá Ibáñez, 2010):
  – Academic setting
  – Measurable elements: what, when, how?
    • Hurtado (1999)
      – Mistakes to be avoided
# Quality parameters

(Marzá Ibáñez, 2010)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>VOC</td>
<td>Vocabulary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ST</td>
<td>Style</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRA</td>
<td>Pragmatics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SUP</td>
<td>Supression</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EX</td>
<td>Excess</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INAD</td>
<td>Inadequacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TM</td>
<td>Timing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PACE</td>
<td>Pace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NMS</td>
<td>Not making sense</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GRAMMAR/ ORT</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DIAL</td>
<td>Dialect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>REG</td>
<td>Register</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TEX</td>
<td>Textual (coherence/ cohesion)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEM</td>
<td>Semiotics (intertextual, cultural refs.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Measuring quality

- Correction sheet for AD (Marzá Ibáñez, 2010)
- -1 for each error
- 2 expert evaluators
Results

- Correlations were tested between CREA scores:
  - The subjectivity variables.
  - The quality variables.
  - Years of experience.

- But NO statistically significant results were found!

- Creativity scores were divided into two groups:
  - < Median
  - > Median
Results

- Normal distribution (Shapiro Wilk)
- Two groups: < median / > median
- T Test (Student)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Style</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>DT</th>
<th>Mediana</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt; Mdn (0,5)</td>
<td>18,80</td>
<td>2,49</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt; Mdn (0,5)</td>
<td>14,00</td>
<td>3,32</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a p = 0,032
# Results

- Normal distribution (Shapiro Wilk)
- Two groups: < median / > median
- T Test (Student)

## Table 1. Comparison Creativity (CREA) & Style

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Style</th>
<th>Crea</th>
<th>Media</th>
<th>DT</th>
<th>Mediana</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>&lt; Mdn (0,5)</td>
<td></td>
<td>18,80</td>
<td>2,49</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>&gt; Mdn (0,5)</td>
<td></td>
<td>14,00</td>
<td>3,32</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[ a \ p = 0.032 \]
Results

Comparison CREA - Style

CREA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>STYLE (ERRORS)</th>
<th>&lt; Mdn (0,5)</th>
<th>&gt; Mdn (0,5)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>CREA</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Results

High correlation

**CREA + expertise**

\((r = 749)\)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>CREA</th>
<th>EXPERTISE (YEARS)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>S.1</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.2</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.3</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.4</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.5</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.6</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.7</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>0,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.8</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.9</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>0,5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S.10</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>0,5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Results

Graph 1. Correlation CREA-expertise
Discussion

1. More creativity = less stylistic errors (higher quality).
Discussion

2. High correlation CREA-expertise:
   a) Does the exercise of the AD profession increase creativity?
   OR/ AND
   a) Do most creative translators work longer as professional audio describers?
Discussion

3. NO correlation CREA-subjectivity:
   – CREA test.
   – Variability:
     • What to describe?
     • **How to describe?**
Variability: How?
Variability: How?
Conclusions I

✓ Our data suggest that the profession may have an impact on the audio describers’ personality.
  - Encourage creativity.

✓ Data also point to an effect of creativity on:
  - The quality of AD (at least in terms of stylistic errors).
  - Self-regulation and adaptation to norms.
Conclusions II

✓ But high variability was found among participants:
  – Subjective information.
  – They all declared to be objective!

✓ More consensus needed:
  – What to describe.
  – How to describe.
Conclusions III

✓ Limitations:
  – 10 participants.
  – Only poetic scenes.
  – 1 creativity test.

✓ Future:
  – Different tests and tasks.
  – Other personality traits.
Thank you!

marinaramos@um.es
anarojo@um.es
Examples

• Clip 1 (The Tree of Life)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Spanish</th>
<th>English</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Se detiene <strong>ante la montaña lejana</strong></td>
<td>He stops <strong>before the distant mountains</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Da da pequeños <strong>brincos</strong>, alza sus brazos hacia ellos <strong>como si quisiera alcanzarlos</strong></td>
<td>He <strong>frolics around and raises his arms as if reaching out for them</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Metaphors**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Spanish Expression</th>
<th>English Translation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>En el cielo azul con nubes blancas, <strong>surcado</strong> por bandadas de gaviotas</td>
<td>A blue sky with white clouds <strong>ploughed</strong> by flocks of gulls</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El mar <strong>prosigue su danza</strong></td>
<td>The sea <strong>continues its dance</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>La marea baja <strong>baña la lengua</strong> de arena</td>
<td>The low tyde <strong>washes over</strong> the <strong>tongue</strong> of sand (spit)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>olas, <strong>teñidas</strong> del color malva</td>
<td>The waves are <strong>tinted</strong> purple</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emotional state of characters</td>
<td>English Translation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>observa con curiosidad</td>
<td>he observes curiously</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El niño camina contento</td>
<td>The boy walks in joy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>camina desconcertado</td>
<td>walking baffled</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>un niño compungido</td>
<td>a gloomy child</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>agita los brazos con paz y alegría</td>
<td>waves his arms peacefully and joyfully</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Connotative Lexicon

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Marea <strong>serena</strong></th>
<th>A <strong>serene</strong> tyde</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Los pájaros vuelan y el niño los <strong>contempla</strong> sonriendo</td>
<td>The birds fly and the child <strong>admires</strong> them while smiling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El sol <strong>despunta</strong></td>
<td>The sun <strong>jets out</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Siluetas <strong>caminando</strong></td>
<td>Silhouettes <strong>walking</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spanish</td>
<td>English</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Se deja abrazar inexpresivamente</td>
<td>Emotionless, he allows her to embrace him</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pasean descalzos y sin prisa</td>
<td>they leisurely walk barefoot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>agita sus brazos efusivamente</td>
<td>Waving his arms effusively</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>decenas de personas solitarias</td>
<td>dozens of solitary people</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>olas de formas imposibles</td>
<td>waves of impossible shapes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Variability: categories